



REVIEW

By Prof. Dr. Bisera Vasileva Valeva, SU "St. Kliment Ohridski",
for participation in a competition for the academic position "Professor",
in the field of higher education 1. Pedagogical sciences, professional direction 1.3.
Pedagogy of training in..., "Methodology of training in fine art", published in SG, no.
24/25/03/2022
with candidate associate professor Dr. Ani Dimova Zlateva

I. Assessment of compliance with the minimum national requirements and the requirements of Thrace University, Stara Zagora:

The materials submitted for review for the habilitation of Associate Professor Ani Dimova Zlateva fully meet the minimum national requirements, are in accordance with and cover the requirements of the Technical University, Stara Zagora for holding the academic position "professor". Assoc. Dr. Ani Zlateva has the required number of points in all groups of indicators of the table with minimum requirements for the scientific and teaching activities of candidates in professional direction 1.3. Pedagogy of training in..., Methodology of training in fine art, according to PPZRASRB.

Besides her indisputable achievements in the field of methodology and the psychology of fine art as the author of a respectable amount of theoretical works, studies and texts, she is an interesting and original sculptor who accepts the challenges of the material and manages to subordinate it to the specifics of the creative intention. The presented work substantiates and unites the various theoretical aspects of her activity (pedagogical, methodological, psychology of creativity) with her long-standing artistic and creative realizations.



II. Research (creative) activity and results:

1. Evaluation of the monographic work, creative performances or other publications corresponding in volume and completeness to a monographic work, including an evaluation of the scientific and scientific-applied contributions of the author:

In the current competition, Prof. Dr. Ani Zlateva presented three monographs - as the main work, a voluminous monograph (Interactive art activities in an informal environment, Academic Publishing House of Thrace University), a published monograph (How to read children's drawings, Malta. University of Malta .Center for Resilience & Socio-Emotional Health), supporting the habilitation, eleven articles printed in specialized professional scientific publications, as well as six textbooks used in the school network. Her texts are the subject of simultaneous theoretical and artistic research, which substantiates a multidisciplinary approach to the considered problematic of teaching fine art in both applied-visual and socio-cultural aspects. The purposeful research and creative activity of Associate Professor Dr. Ani Zlateva is based on a wide study of numerous domestic and foreign textual sources, as well as on conclusions and summaries drawn on the basis of many years of personal pedagogical and artistic experience.

The main carrier and theoretical focus on the pedagogical research and methodological experience of the author is the monograph presented by her "Interactive Art Activities in an Informal Environment", with a volume of 282 pages. The text emphasizes the specifics of the organization and conducting of interactive activities for children in preschool, primary and junior high school age with art in an informal environment. The research focus is on the problem of the emergence and concept of non-formal education, as well as on basic principles defining learning in such an environment. The author presents visual and methodical approaches imposed in non-formal education and caused by its characteristics. The historical overview of its various forms in Bulgaria is interesting, with the main emphasis being on the emergence of community centers (January 30, 1856, town of Svishtov) and women's educational societies (Lom). The



text clarifies the important role of non-formal education in a museum and gallery environment - an approach widely applied in the West and not so popular in our country. The author's view of this education in the field of visual arts and the development of artistic practices in our country is particularly interesting. Prof. Zlateva notes that this is a good correlation in the context of education in general "as a means of bridging the gap between the separate spheres of education, arts and culture" (p. 73). The detailed historical follow-up of activities with visual arts in the field of formal education (didactic art) in our country with an emphasis on the activities of G. Palashev and his followers makes an impression. This in-depth historical survey of the traditions and development of various forms of non-formal education, stemming from compulsory education, in Bulgaria is a valuable research contribution.

The monograph pays attention to the interactive methodological forms, as well as to those in which non-formal learning is applied in an electronic and online environment, extremely relevant recently, and also to the resulting practices in visual arts activities in general.

The second part of the text specifies the various interactive forms containing a wide, even provocative, range of visual techniques. Of interest are the reproduced images from art projects (studios) on pages 168-170, representing collaborations of students and schoolchildren, in which the visual language is provoked by the creation of collages (recycled materials and papers) and thus the creative thinking of the participants develops. The quality of the text is the presented comparative analysis of the results of interactive informal art activities in real, electronic and hybrid environments. It is essential to focus on the benefits of art activities, which, in addition to the acquisition and development of visual skills, also increase interest in other fields of science and art. Such are the examples from pages 204 to 207, in which, in addition to the legibility of the image, the cognitive result is also realized. The conclusions in the monograph strengthen the understanding of the need to popularize art among children, young people and adults, which in turn creates a thinking and empathetic audience. The author



suggests and proposes the construction of systematicity and cyclicity in the activities related to art activities in popular and accessible urban spaces.

Very close, even identical, are the conclusions that arise from the analysis of the results of the application of interactive activities with fine art (in the part about its perception) in a museum and gallery environment, since the author considers the growing interest in contact with certain artifacts in the original in all participating. In this part of the monograph, Prof. Dr. Ani Zlateva focuses on the adaptation of informal learning projects in an electronic and hybrid environment. Such a very relevant example is the project "Earth has no replica" presented on pages 256-264. As a methodological contribution, the various "interactive forms of pedagogical interaction in the visual arts can be noted, among which are effective teaching strategies used in interactive teaching and learning, including problem-based learning, collaborative learning, experiential learning, active learning, exploratory learning and learning through play'.

The author focuses on various types of virtual tours and video lessons in the implementation of informal education, which qualitatively support it and contribute to its development in the conditions of imposed social isolation. The text also focuses on sharing resources such as online courses, YouTube videos, e-books, and student-friendly varieties of "online informal education, such as some of the most popular learning platforms." However, however, Associate Professor Zlateva emphasizes in her text the important role of the dedicated pedagogue, as well as contact, communication and interaction with art in reality.

Overall, the research and methodological concepts in the text of Associate Professor Dr. Ani Zlateva make sense of the complexity in the materialization of the pedagogue in the field of fine arts, as they refer to the balanced interaction of formal (classical) and informal forms of education.

2. Evaluation of the contributions in the other attached publications (creative performances) made after the appointment of the academic academic position "associate professor" (for professor candidates):



Supporting the habilitation monograph of the author is an interesting monograph in English, published in 2019, attached to the paper. from the University of Malta - How to read children's drawings. In it, Associate Professor Dr. Ani Zlateva presents and analyzes the features, complexity and importance of the pictorial process in childhood, pointing out its most important characteristics, its psycho-emotional basis when determining the stages in the development of children's drawing.

The summaries about the time sequence in children's visual activity, based on the study of various theoretical sources, have a contributing character in the text, with the emphasis on the opinions of some of its most significant researchers - Vygotsky, Goodinough, Reed, Golomb, Malchiodi, etc. The quality of the author's research activity is the illustrations published in the book, created by the children under her personal supervision and guidance of their visual activity and illustrating the theses of the text. In the monograph, Associate Professor Dr. Ani Zlateva launched some of the most frequently used approaches in modern methodological and age-psychological practice. The text structures basic principles of diagnosis on children's drawings and diagnostic drawing tests. It focuses attention on the phenomenon of "children's drawings" and the possibilities of the teacher for reporting on the final form of image important parameters of overall development - intellectual and psycho-emotional. The author's professionalism respects the use of a wide range of tests such as: (Draw-a-Person-Test (DAP), based on the Goodenough methodology, Draw-a-Person-Test (DAP), based on the Machover methodology, Technique for Kinetic Family Drawing (KFD) and that of Prout and Phillips' (1974) Kinetic School Drawing (KSD) Technique. An achievement and contribution of the text is the rich visual material presented of drawings of human figures by children with intellectual delay, or by children showing different peculiarities in development, and the images structure an interesting pedagogical and methodological approach to the essence of the obtained deformations (differences) in the images of both the human figure and the drawings from the child's



closest environment - the family and the school. The attached ones are especially interesting examples from pages 111-112, as well as on page 116, giving rise to various professional (pedagogical-methodical, psycho-pictorial) interpretations based on the visual material and shaping directions of therapeutic work.

From the impressive volume of shorter and concentrated texts, I single out three - one co-authored (with K. Tineva-Gyurkovska), indexed in Web of Sciences and two independent, one of which is indexed in Web of Sciences.

In the 2020 article "Developing integrated design based pedagogical and art skills in an informal environment" (Zlateva A., Tineva-Gyurkovska, K. (2020). Developing integrated design based pedagogical and art skills in an informal environment In: *Pedagogika*. 2020. P: 687 -695. (INDEXED IN THE WEB OF SCIENCE DATABASE) tracked and analyzed part of the processes related to the development of integrated design-based pedagogical and visual skills in children in an informal environment. The presented conceptual framework of the study is based on some theoretical and empirical pedagogical models , which are aimed at stimulating creative thinking and upgrading children's visual skills. The authors are committed to the creation of multidisciplinary and integrated connections with various scientific disciplines in a theoretical and analytical aspect. The analysis of the possibility and choice in communication with interpreted visual prototypes for children versus historically significant artifacts selected from East's collection the oric museum of the city of Stara Zagora. The conclusions and conclusions of the text are significant with the proposed direction in the development of pedagogical and methodical practice, not only in the field of fine arts education, but also in other educational areas.

The independent text from 2019 is of interest. - Zlateva, A. (2019) Reflecting the Level of Social Adaptation in the Drawings of Children Aged 6 – 7. In: *Pedagogika*. 5/2019. P: 687-695. (INDEXED IN THE WEB OF SCIENCE). The object and purpose of the presented research is the use of children's drawings as a diagnostic tool for determining the level of social adaptation in the intermediate preschool and primary school age (6-7



years), since social skills, somewhat formed, are extremely important for the new social (school) environment. The author presents a creative adaptation of various test subjects, on the basis of which the received children's drawings are analyzed to diagnose the child's attitude to the social environment. In the summarized conclusions, Associate Professor Dr. Ani Zlateva "translates" the received graphic structures-a message about the child's level of social development and his awareness in relation to the environment. The text presents the author's position, according to which with the use of the easier, at this stage, figurative language, the child expresses his personal position both as an independent person and in relation to society, although limited to the people who surround him.

In 2019, Associate Professor Dr. Ani Zlateva published the very interesting text "Art as a means of developing the educational and creative potential of children and students with specific learning difficulties" printed in "Pedagogical Forum", no. 1, 2019 (DOI: 10.15547/PF.2019.004). This text continues her creative interest related to some pedagogical searches and understandings about teaching fine art to children with difficulties and about educational difficulties in relation to the characteristics of children who encounter them. It emphasizes the creative potential of the contingent of children studied, presented and summarized in the studies of various foreign authors. The author's thesis is that the development of certain spheres of the field of art could support not only the enhancement of specific visual skills and capabilities, but could also be a means of developing learning opportunities as a whole. The application of art activities in the learning process for children with SEN in different educational areas helps to stimulate differentiated visual perceptions, which are realized and contribute to the development of visual-spatial memory. Prof. Zlateva also emphasizes in this text the application of visual activity in education, through which creative and non-standard approaches are encouraged in solving other, different educational tasks. The contribution of the article is that it formulates conclusions that link the increase in the



achievements of children and students in the field of the main types of fine art with the increase in their self-esteem and success rate in other school subjects as well.

In general, in the short texts of the habilitation work, in addition to the already noted conclusions and generalizations, the studies related to the timely manifestation and recognition of gifted children in the field of visual arts are of interest. The author has formulated a number of indicators by which gifted children can be distinguished at an early stage of their development. The listed indicators, according to her, are characteristic of the drawings of these children and are always distinguishable and related to elements such as shape and details in the images, to the reflection of space in the drawing and to non-template compositional solutions.

In addition to the field of pedagogy and methods of teaching fine art, Assoc. Dr. Ani Zlateva is also the author of monumental sand sculptures, as well as small sculptures. In both directions of her artistic realization, the aspiration to plastic solutions unusual for the material, to the use of incompatible materials, to the departure from the convenience of illustrativeness and the conceptualization of the final works is noticeable. The combination of natural natural materials (stone, for example), with the consciously sought-after range of processed metal, gives the cavalcade sculptural works a special warmth and an opportunity for the viewer to take refuge in the security of dreams or to return to distant childhood memories. These compositions do not need formal gallery spaces to highlight the richness of the visual accents and their overall artistic impact. Particularly impressive are the monumental sculptures and sculptural ensembles of Ani Zlateva, realized from non-permanent material (sand). The application of classical traditions in the compositions, through the combination of low and high relief, of separate volumetric sculptures, create a picturesque impact and emphasize the conceptual, unconventional author's decision. This artistic influence is particularly legible in the interpretation according to Jan Sten. The multiple zooms as well as the moving material create a simultaneous sense of both familiarity and discovery, turning the final visual product into a conceptual one. In all realized "sand sculptures", the



originality of Ani Zlateva's creative solutions succeeds in reformulating the separate volumetric visions into a unified emotional impact.

3. Citation by other authors:

Based on her numerous theoretical works, Assoc. Dr. Ani Zlateva has a sufficient number of citations, which is evident from the reference she provided for NACID. Of the attached 28 pcs. citations, I apply those that are from scientific publications, referenced and indexed in world-famous databases: 1. Zlateva, A. (2019). How to Read Children's Drawings. Fifth Monograph in Resilience and Health by the Center for Resilience and Socio-Emotional Health, University of Malta. ISBN: 978-99957-890-5-3 (electronic) ISBN: 978-99957-890-4-6 (paperback) in 2. Ertaş, Ç., Ghasemi, V., & Kuhzady, S. (2021). Exploring tourism perceptions of children through drawing. *Anatolia*, 1-13; 2. Zlateva, A., Tineva-Giurkovska, K. & Petrov, P. (2018). The Role of Art Activities as a Form of School Dropout Prevention. *Pedagogika – Pedagogy*, 90(6) in 7. Teneva, M. (2020). The refusal of education in the modern society of knowledge. *Pedagogy*, 92(5), 677-687; 3. Zlateva, A., & Zdravkova, N. (2013). MENTAL CHARACTERISTICS STUDY OF CHILDREN DEPRIVED OF PARENTAL CARE THROUGH STANDARD DRAWING METHODOLOGIES APPLICATION. *Trakia Journal of Sciences*, 11(3), 303 in Chung, I. J., Lee, J., Sawada, Y., Sim, S. G., & Son, J. (2021). Living Environments and Child Development: Comparing Two Groups of Out-of-Home Children. *Journal of Human Capital*, 15(2), 346-371; 4. Zlateva, A., & Zdravkova, N. (2013). MENTAL CHARACTERISTICS STUDY OF CHILDREN DEPRIVED OF PARENTAL CARE THROUGH STANDARD DRAWING METHODOLOGIES APPLICATION. *Trakia Journal of Sciences*, 11(3), 303 in Morović, M. L., Matijević, V., Divljaković, K., Kraljević, M., & Dimić, Z. (2015). Drawing skills in children with neurodevelopmental delay aged 2-5 years. *Acta clinica Croatica*, 54(2); 5. Zlateva, A. (2013). The Problems of Aesthetic Education of Pedagogy Students. In: *Journal for Educational Science and Arts*, Trakia University, Faculty of Education, Volume 1/2013 Stara Zagora. (p. 134- p.139) ISSN - JESA – 2367-5276 in Borisova, T. Reading comprehension a problem for the pedagogical students. *Pedagogika-Pedagogy*, 2020, 92, 5, 671-676; 6. Zlateva, A. & Stoykova, Zh. (2008). Art therapy and psychological counseling. Stara Zagora: University of Thrace in Boyadzieva, N. The principle of education and therapy through art in Bulgaria (Growth and contemporary state). *Pedagogika-Pedagogy*, 88, 8, 1021-1035; 7. Zlateva, A. (2006). Illustration as a form of perfecting image thinking in children at primary-school age. *Yearbook of the Faculty of Education*, Trakia University, Stara Zagora in Borisova, T. Reading comprehension a problem for the pedagogical students. *Pedagogika-Pedagogy*, 2020, 92, 5, 671-676.



4. Evaluation of the results of participation in research and creative projects and application of the obtained results in practice:

Assoc. Dr. Ani Zlateva has participated in numerous academic and creative projects at home and abroad, which she presented in the reference for NACID. Impressive is her participation in projects such as: K-TRIO (Researchers in KnowledgeTriangle), "Researchers in the Knowledge Triangle (K-TRIO 3) H2020-MSCA-NIGHT-2018", Horizon 2020 Program (Project funded by the European Commission on Maria Sklodowska Curie of the Horizon 2020 program, also known as the European Night of Scientists initiative); Project on the topic: "Yearbook of the Faculty of Pedagogy" Thrace University - Stara Zagora (No. 3/2018); Project on the topic: "Yearbook of the Pedagogical Faculties" Thrace University - Stara Zagora (No. 3/2017); "Prevention of dropping out of school" Thrace University - Stara Zagora (No. 3/2016/17); 2016 - participation in a project of Thrace University, Stara Zagora, with the theme: "Research of communicative and social competences in education as a phenomenon of the environment", as well as participation in the same year in a project of Thrace University, Stara Zagora, with the theme: "Prevention of dropping out of school"; Participation in 2015 in the "Methodology for the development of talents and strengths", a project of the University of Thrace, with the director of the project Assoc. Dr. Valentina Sharlanova, in the same year participated in the project: "Updating the curricula in higher education in accordance with the requirements on the labor market" - Ministry of Education and Science. European Social Fund. Operational Program "Human Resources Development"; Prof. Dr. Ani Zlateva participates in an international project on the topic: "Gifted and Talented Children's Teachers' and Parents' Training - acronym GATE" under the "Leonardo da Vinci" sectoral program.

Development in 2013. of a concept and project for new scientific journals of the Faculty of Pedagogy - TrU, with the project director Assoc. Dr. Violeta



Kartzelyanska-Stancheva, in the same year also participated in a project with the theme Formation of metacognitive components of general learning skills through integrative functions of the game and game technologies in the pedagogical interaction, project of the University of Thrace, director of the project Prof. Dr. Petar Petrov.

III. Educational and teaching activities:

Assoc. Dr. Ani Zlateva has the necessary academic employment in "Methodology of fine art", "Pedagogy of visual activities in PG", "Art therapy" at the Faculty of Pedagogy of the University of Thrace, Stara Zagora. In addition to this main discipline, she has lectures on "Drawing", "Perspective" and "Sculpture" with the students of the pedagogical specialties. Associate Professor Ani Zlateva is the author of the curriculum of a new specialty at Thrace University - "Pedagogy of Fine Art and Graphic Design Education". He is the supervisor of two successfully defended doctoral students, and currently has one doctoral student. Her organizational skills, acquired in managing projects, organizing exhibitions, conferences and seminars, are evident

IV. Administrative and public activity:

Assoc. Dr. Ani Zlateva is the general secretary of the Council of Ministers. He is a member of the Faculty Council of PF and the Academic Council of Thrace University, Stara Zagora. She was nominated by the Union of Scientists in 2020. for the "Alarm Clock of Stara Zagora", being awarded an honorary certificate and a statuette.

V. Personal impressions of the candidate (if any):

Prof. Dr. Ani Zlateva is not only a good professional, but also a responsive and punctual colleague. Regardless of her academic dedication and workload, she manages to realize a serious volume of creative work, a consequence and result of purposeful artistic activity. I cannot but highlight the numerous participations in sculpture projects and festivals (after 2013). In 2022, 2020, 2019, 2018 – Sand sculpture project Veluws



Zandsculpturenfestijn in Garderen, Netherlands; In 2019 – Project to create sand sculptures in Lappeenranta (Hiekkalinna, Lappeenranta), Finland; Sand Sculpture Project Sandland International Antalya Sand Sculpture Festival in Antalya, R. Turkey; Presepe di Sabbia Rimini Sand Sculpture Project in Rimini, Italy; Project for creating sand sculptures Festival of sand sculptures, Burgas; In 2018 – Project to create sand sculptures Sandland International Antalya Sand Sculpture Festival in Antalya, R. Turkey; Presepe di Sabbia Rimini Sand Sculpture Project in Rimini, Italy; Sand Sculpture Project Sand Sculpture Festival, Burgas, Bulgaria; In 2017 – Project to create sand sculptures Sandland International Antalya Sand Sculpture Festival in Antalya, R. Turkey; Presepe di Sabbia Rimini Sand Sculpture Project in Rimini, Italy; Sand Sculpture Project Sand Sculpture Festival, Burgas, Bulgaria; Sand sculpture project Zandverhalen in Elburg, Netherlands; In 2016 – Project to create sand sculptures Sandland International Antalya Sand Sculpture Festival in Antalya, R. Turkey; Presepe di Sabbia Rimini Sand Sculpture Project in Rimini, Italy; Sand Sculpture Project Sand Sculpture Festival, Burgas, Bulgaria; In 2015 and 2014 – Project to create sand sculptures Sandland International Antalya Sand Sculpture Festival in Antalya, R. Turkey; Presepe di Sabbia Rimini Sand Sculpture Project in Rimini, Italy; Sand Sculpture Project Sand Sculpture Festival, Burgas, Bulgaria.

VI. Conclusion:

In conclusion, based on my overall positive assessment of the presented habilitation thesis, as well as my impressions of the artistic and creative work of the candidate, I propose to the respected members of the scientific jury to choose the academic position "Professor" of Pedagogical Sciences, professional direction 1.3 . Pedagogy of training in..., "Methodology of fine art training", Assoc. Dr. Ani Dimova Zlateva and direct this proposal - election to the Academic Council of Thrace University, Stara Zagora.

Signature:

Prof. Dr. Bisera Valeva



Date:29.08.2022г